SAF Airstrike Campaign in North Darfur: Markets Damaged, Civilians Impacted

10 October 2024

Yale SCHOOL OF PUBLIC HEALTH
Humanitarian Research Lab

© 2024 Humanitarian Research Lab at Yale School of Public Health. Imagery © 2024 Maxar, USG-Plus, © 2024 Maxar Technologies, © 2024 SkyFi.

This report was independently produced by the Yale School of Public Health's Humanitarian Research Lab with the support of the Avaaz Foundation. Learn more at https://medicine.yale.edu/lab/khoshnood/ and https://avaaz.org.

The Faculty Director of the Humanitarian Research Lab (HRL) at the Yale School of Public Health is Dr. Kaveh Khoshnood. The analysis and production of this report was overseen by HRL Executive Director Nathaniel Raymond and Caitlin Howarth. Analysis and report production was conducted by the Humanitarian Research Lab's Conflict Analytics team.

Citation | Caitlin N. Howarth, Kaveh Khoshnood, Nathaniel A. Raymond et al. "SAF Airstrike Campaign in North Darfur: Markets Damaged, Civilians Impacted." 10 October 2024. Humanitarian Research Lab at Yale School of Public Health: New Haven.

I. Key Findings

The Yale School of Public Health's Humanitarian Research Lab (HRL) has assessed conflict-related damage consistent with airstrikes to markets in both Kutum and Kuma, North Darfur between 9 August and 6 October 2024 in satellite imagery analysis. This damage is highly likely due to airstrikes by Sudan Armed Forces (SAF). Open sources reported that both Kutum and Kuma's markets were damaged due to SAF airstrikes on their respective market days, on 30 September and 4 October 2024.

Likely SAF airstrike activity has reportedly increased as fighting expands across Darfur.¹ These airstrikes are killing civilians and Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs). Attacks on markets, especially on market days, increases the chances of civilian casualties and likely destroys food stores and other critical goods. The Famine Early Warning System Network (FEWS NET) has determined that Kutum and Kuma face Integrated Phase Classification (IPC) 4 Emergency conditions, the second highest level of food insecurity.² Markets are likely to be densely populated on market days and serve as critical infrastructure. Attacks on markets in these communities, which include IDPs, will likely make current food insecurity conditions more severe. Rapid Support Forces (RSF) have controlled both Kutum and Kuma since at least June 2023 and April 2024, respectively, and used these locations as a part of RSF's siege on El-Fasher.³ Conflict parties have certain obligations to protect critical infrastructure under international humanitarian law.⁴

Kuma

Yale HRL corroborates open source reports of airstrikes to the Friday Market in Kuma, North Darfur through satellite imagery analysis of damage to structures between 9 August – 5 October 2024. Open sources reported that an alleged SAF airstrike killed at least 65 people, including 13 children, and wounded approximately 200 people. The airstrike, which occurred on the regular market day in Kuma, impacted the "crowded" weekly Friday market on 4 October 2024. This airstrike is one of the deadliest reported in this conflict. Kuma has served as the civil administration of the Ziyadiya, who are part of the northern Rizeigat ethnic group. Open sources have reported that fighting in El-Fasher has displaced people to Kuma, and Yale HRL has identified temporary structures in satellite imagery consistent with IDP shelters in Kuma.

Kutum

Yale HRL corroborates open-source reports of airstrikes to the market in Kutum, North Darfur through satellite imagery analysis collected between 25 September and 6 October 2024. Open sources reported that SAF airstrikes on Monday 30 September damaged the Kutum city market on a market day, as well as residential neighborhoods, killing at least five people. Yale HRL also identifies prior conflict-related damage consistent with an aerial attack on the west side of the same market through satellite imagery analysis collected between 20 August and 25 September 2024. The Protection Cluster in Sudan estimates as of 30 June 2024 that 200,000 people reside in Kutum and neighboring Kassab and Fata Borno IDP camps. Kutum is home to both Rizeigat and non-Arab populations, including a large Zaghawa community.

Methodology

Yale HRL utilizes data fusion methodologies of open source and remote sensing data analysis. Yale HRL produced this report through the cross-corroboration of open source data, including social media, local news reporting, multimedia, and other verified reports, and remote sensing data, including satellite imagery and thermal sensor data. This analysis involves identifying possible events, geolocating them, and assessing the likelihood that an event has occurred through the cross-corroboration of both open source and satellite imagery data.

Researchers analyzed open source data across social media, news reports, and other publicly available sources to identify and verify incidents. Analysts assess the credibility and reliability of open source data based on a source's past reliability and the corroboration of other independent sources.

Satellite imagery analysis relies on multi-temporal change detection, which involves the comparison of two or more satellite images of the same area captured at different times to detect differences in coloration, visual properties, and presence, absence, or positional change of objects across the images. Visual indicators of damage include: discoloration to the analyzed structure, including indicators of possible burning or charring; observable difference in structural texture compared to pre-event dates including total or partial collapse or serious failure of the walls and roofs of the analyzed structure; munitions impact points; and presence of damage proxies such as debris. Analysts assess the type and source of damage based on a range of indicators, including the qualities and extent of damage to a structure and surrounding area and other signatures of munition impacts or other forms of damage.

Limitations

There are significant limitations to the data fusion methodology. The information environment in Sudan does not have the breadth of data available in other locations and there is likely a significant reporting bias for those who provide open source reporting.

The tools and techniques present significant challenges to assess activities such as extrajudicial detention, conflict-related sexual violence (CRSV), and conflict-related casualties, particularly in environments with limited data.

Satellite imagery analysis is limited by available imagery over time and space. Available nadir angles of satellite imagery can produce challenges to assess structural damage, until multiple angles and ground-level photographic and video materials emerge to help inform the analysis.

¹ Sarah "Over 500 Sudanese killed in air strikes" Dabanga Radio TV Online. 8 October 2024. https://www.dabangasudan.org/en/all-news/article/over-500-sudanese-killed-in-air-strikes, archived at https://perma.cc/5XLR-XG4F; Caitlin N. Howarth, Kaveh Khoshnood, Nathaniel A. Raymond et al. "Confirmation of High-Tempo Aerial Bombardment in El-Fasher, 1-6 October 2024." 07 October 2024. Humanitarian

```
Research Lab at Yale School of Public Health: New Haven https://files-
profile.medicine.yale.edu/documents/c7e7a736-f0b1-48fc-9a30-346c3dc00475,
archived at https://perma.cc/SLZ4-9D6G; Caitlin N. Howarth, Kaveh Khoshnood,
Nathaniel A. Raymond et al. "Free-Fire Zone: Widespread Aerial and Artillery
Bombardment across El-Fasher." 13 September 2024. Humanitarian Research Lab at
Yale School of Public Health: New Haven https://files-
profile.medicine.yale.edu/documents/5821eb40-d432-4e71-867d-53870f829e7a,
archived at https://perma.cc/7NK5-62GN.
<sup>2</sup> FEWS NET, "Famine (IPC Phase 5) is ongoing in part of Al Fasher, North Darfur" 2024,
https://fews.net/east-africa/sudan/food-security-outlook/june-2024, archived at
https://perma.cc/3CJX-7SCM
<sup>3</sup> Radio Dabanga, "North Darfur's Kutum has fallen into RSF hands" June 6, 2023.
https://www.dabangasudan.org/en/all-news/article/north-darfurs-kutum-has-fallen-
into-rsf-hands, archived at https://perma.cc/MMS3-5ABV;
https://www.darfur24.com/2024/04/24/%d9%82%d9%88%d8%a7%d8%aa-%d8%a7%
d9%84%d8%af%d8%b9%d9%85-%d8%a7%d9%84%d8%b3%d8%b1%d9%8a%d8%b9-%
d8%aa%d8%b4%d8%af%d8%af-%d8%a7%d9%84%d8%ad%d8%b5%d8%a7%d8%b1-%
d8%b9%d9%84%d9%89-%d9%85%d8%af%d9%8a%d9%86/
<sup>4</sup> Sudan War Monitor, "Wave of SAF airstrikes in North Darfur kills dozens of civilians,"
https://sudanwarmonitor.com/p/wave-of-saf-airstrikes-in-north-darfur, archived at
https://perma.cc/4C8B-F2DS; International Committee of the Red Cross
(ICRC), "Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating
to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I)," United
Nations Treaty Series 1125, no. 17512 (8 June 1977), Article 57,
https://www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6b36b4.html, archived at https://perma.
cc/9BY8-Y537; International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC), "Rule 10. Civilian
Objects' Loss of Protection from Attack," <a href="https://ihl-">https://ihl-</a>
databases.icrc.org/en/customaryihl/v1/rule10, archived at https://perma.cc/4KBF-
7ECE; International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC), "What objects are specially
protected under IHL?" August 14, 2017, https://blogs.icrc.org/ilot/2017/08/14/objects-
specially-protected-ihl/, archived at https://perma.cc/KH5T-ZG99
<sup>5</sup> Radio Dabanga, "El Koma in North Darfur buries 65 victims of Sudan air force
attacks," October 6, 2024, https://www.dabangasudan.org/en/all-news/article/el-
koma-in-north-darfur-buries-65-victims-of-sudan-air-force-attacks, archived at
https://perma.cc/73V5-CMTW; UNICEF, "Amid relentless attacks on children in Sudan,
at least 13 children reportedly killed and another 4 injured in Al Kuma, North Darfur,"
October 7, 2024, https://www.unicef.org/sudan/press-releases/amid-relentless-
attacks-children-sudan-least-13-children-reportedly-killed-and, archived at
https://archive.ph/tB87u; International Organization for Migration," DTM Sudan Flash
Alert: Conflict in Al Koma (Al Koma Town), North Darfur," October 6, 2024,
https://mailchi.mp/iom/dtm-sudan-flash-alert-conflict-in-al-koma-al-koma-town-
مقتل "north-darfur-update-001, archived at <a href="https://perma.cc/M7J5-DLQG">https://perma.cc/M7J5-DLQG</a>; Blue News, "مقتل
,October 4, 2024 "وإصابة "350" مواطن جراء قصف طيران "الجيش" لسوق مدينة "الكومة" بشمال دارفور، اليوم الجمعة.
https://bluefornews.net/?p=13284, archived at <a href="https://perma.cc/72NW-84ST">https://perma.cc/72NW-84ST</a>;
عشرات القتلي والجرحي جراء غارة جوية للجيش استهدفت سوق مدينة الكومة بشمال دار فور جميع الحقوق ", Medameek News
"October 5, 2024 "محفوظة لصحيفة مداميك، لقراءة المزيد قم بزيارة
https://www.medameek.com/?p=157815, archived at https://perma.cc/U4T6-F878;
,October 5, 2024 "انتقادات لقصف الجيش سوقاً في شمال دار فور وقتل العشرات" Sudan Tribune,
https://sudantribune.net/article291726/, archived at https://perma.cc/A6F5-TVM9
<sup>6</sup> Darfur24 "100 People Killed and Injured in Army Airstrikes on Hasahisa" Darfur24. 8
October 2024, https://www.darfur24.com/en/2024/10/08/100-people-killed-and-
```

```
injured-in-army-airstrikes-on-hasahisa/, archived at https://perma.cc/M6ED-LQCG;
Darfur24 "30 Killed as Army Launches Airstrike on Hamrat al-Sheikh, North Kordofan"
Darfur24. https://www.darfur24.com/en/2024/10/06/30-killed-as-army-launches-
airstrike-on-hamrat-al-sheikh-north-kordofan/, archived at https://perma.cc/4RM9-
Dabanga Radio TV "معارك عنيفة في الفاشر.. وغارات جوية في مليط ونيالا والدالي وشرق النيل" Dabanga Radio TV
Online. 12 September 2024. https://www.dabangasudan.org/ar/all-
news/article/%D9%85%D8%B9%D8%A7%D8%B1%D9%83-%D8%B9%D9%86%D9%8A
%D9%81%D8%A9-%D9%81%D9%8A-%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%81%D8%A7%D8%B4%D8
%B1-%D9%88%D8%BA%D8%A7%D8%B1%D8%A7%D8%AA-%D8%AC%D9%88%D9%8
A%D8%A9-%D9%81%D9%8A-%D9%85, archived at https://perma.cc/T3EV-CJBY;
Abdelmounem Idris "قتلي وجرحي مدنيون في قصف جوي على مناطق بالجزيرة وسنار" Dabanga Radio TV Online.
13 April 2024, https://www.dabangasudan.org/ar/all-
news/article/%D9%82%D8%AA%D9%84%D9%89-%D9%88%D8%AC%D8%B1%D8%AD
%D9%89-%D9%85%D8%AF%D9%86%D9%8A%D9%8A%D9%86-%D9%81%D9%8A-%D
9%82%D8%B5%D9%81-%D8%AC%D9%88%D9%8A-%D8%B9%D9%84%D9%89-%D9%8
5%D9%86%D8%A7%D8%B7%D9%82-%D8%A8, archived at https://perma.cc/UC7W-
```

- Al-Rakoba, "مسلحون قبليون لحماية طريق تجاري يربط دار فور بشمال السودان" April 1, 2024, https://www.alrakoba.net/31916804/%D9%85%D8%B3%D9%84%D8%AD%D9%88%D9%86-%D9%82%D8%A8%D9%84%D9%8A%D9%88-%D9%84%D8%AD%D9%85%D8%A7%D9%8A%D8%A9-%D8%B7%D8%B1%D9%8A%D9%82-%D8%AA%D8%AC%D8%A7%D8%B1%D9%8A-%D9%8A%D8%B1%D8%A8%D8%B7-%D8%AF/, archived at https://perma.cc/SXK3-MPVZ
- ⁸ Darfur24," (إلى الكومة August 15, 2024, https://www.darfur24.com/2024/08/15/%D9%88%D8%B5%D9%84%D9%88%D8%A7-%D8%B3%D9%8A%D8%B1%D9%8B%D8%A7-%D8%B9%D9%84%D9%89-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A3%D9%82%D8%AF%D8%A7%D9%85-%D9%86%D8%B2%D9%88%D8%AD-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A2%D9%84%D8%A7%D9%81-%D9%85%D9%86/, archived at https://perma.cc/R2K5-EYRT
- 9 Mohamed Haj Nour, "مقتل خمسة على الأقل وإصابة عدد آخرين جراء قصف الطيران على مدينة كتم" Sudan War Monitor, September 30, 2024, https://sudanwarmonitor.com/p/859, archived at https://perma.cc/R948-KVSP; Radio Dabanga, " تجدد المعارك في الفاشر، وقصف جوي على كتم بشمال دار فور" September 30, 2024, https://www.dabangasudan.org/ar/all-news/article/%D8%AA%D8%AC%D8%AF%D8%AF-%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%85%D8%B9%D8%A7%D8%B1%D9%83-%D9%81%D9%8A-%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%81%D8%A7%D8%B7%D8%B7%D9%81%D9%88-%D9%88%D9%84%D9%81-%D8%AC%D9%88%D9%88A-%D8%B5%D9%81-%D8%AC%D9%88%D9%88A-%D8%B5%D9%81-%D8%AC%D9%88%D9%88A-%D8%B9%D9%84%D9%89-%D9%83%D8%AA, archived at https://perma.cc/W57C-
- ¹⁰ Global Protection Cluster, "Protection Hotspots in Sudan," July 2024," https://globalprotectioncluster.org/sites/default/files/2024-07/idps_hotspot_localities_dashboard_as_of_30_june_24.pdf, archived at https://perma.cc/33ZL-72TE
- ¹¹ Sudan Tribune, "موسى هلال يتبنى مؤتمر صلح بين الرزيقات والزغاوة بشمال دارفور" September 26, 2014, https://sudantribune.net/article77108/, archived at https://perma.cc/U7ZN-VV67; Maud Jullien et al., "The Kutum Massacre," Lighthouse Reports, Sky News, and Le Monde, September 9, 2024, https://www.lighthousereports.com/investigation/the-kutum-massacre/, archived at https://perma.cc/J2ZG-D5ZJ

Market, Kuma, North Darfur

CONFLICT-RELATED DAMAGE OBSERVED BETWEEN 09 AUGUST-05 OCTOBER 2024



09 August 2024 © 2024 Maxar, USG-Plus

Analysis of satellite imagery collected between 09 August and 05 October 2024 shows damage consistent with that from an aerial attack to structures of the market in Kuma.

Open sources reported that the market had been damaged by SAF airstrikes on Friday 04 October 2024. Kuma's market day is reportedly Friday.



05 October 2024 © 2024 SkyFi

Sources | Radio Dabanga, "El Koma in North Darfur buries 65 victims of Sudan air force attacks," October 6, 2024, https://www.dabangasudan.org/en/all-news/article/el-koma-in-north-darfur-buries-65-victims-of-sudan-air-force-attacks, archived at https://perma.cc/73V5-CMTW; Sudan Tribune, "انتقادات لقصف "October 5, 2024, https://sudantribune.net/article291726/, archived at https://perma.cc/A6F5-TVM9.

Market, Kutum, North Darfur

CONFLICT-RELATED DAMAGE OBSERVED BETWEEN 25 SEPTEMBER-06 OCTOBER 2024



25 September 2024 © 2024 Maxar, USG-Plus

Analysis of satellite imagery collected between 25 September and 06 October 2024 shows damage consistent with that from an aerial attack to structures adjacent to a mosque in the market area of Kutum.

Open sources reported that the market had been damaged by SAF airstrikes on 30 September 2024, which is reportedly a market day.



06 October 2024 © 2024 Maxar, USG-Plus

Sources | Mohamed Haj Nour, " مقيد الطيران على مدينة كتم" (Sources | Mohamed Haj Nour, " مقدل الطيران على مدينة كتم" (Sudan War Monitor, September 30, 2024, https://sudanwarmonitor.com/p/859, archived at https://perma.cc/R948-KVSP; Radio Dabanga, " تجدد المعارك في الفاشر، وقصف جوي على كتم بشمال دارفور" (September 30, 2024, https://www.dabangasudan.org/ar/all-news/article/%D8%AA%D8%AC%D8%AF%D8%AF-%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%85%D8%B9%D8%A7%D8%B1%D9%83-%D9%81%D9%8A-

archived at https://perma.cc/W57C-QQVA

Market, Kutum

CONFLICT-RELATED DAMAGE OBSERVED BETWEEN 20 AUGUST-25 SEPTEMBER 2024



20 August 2024 © 2024 Maxar, USG-Plus

Analysis of satellite imagery collected between 20 August and 25 September, shows damage consistent with that from an aerial attack to structures and a tree on the west side of the market in Kutum.

The structures are visibly obscured by the tree in 20 August imagery. However, imagery from 25 September shows the tree collapsed and its body burned, with the charred remains of building foundations beneath.



25 September 2024 © 2024 Maxar, USG-Plus

Yale school of public health Humanitarian Research Lab

https://medicine.yale.edu/lab/khoshnood/